

SCHOLARLY STUDIES

The right to collective bargaining in the military, police, and public sector.

A comparative law perspective¹

Professor PhD Raluca DIMITRIU

Faculty of Law, Bucharest University of Economic Studies

Abstract: *The right to collective bargaining is regulated differently depending on the legal system. A common basis does exist, however: this is the International Labour Organisation Convention no. 154 (1981), ratified by 50 states, including most of the member states of the European Union.*

However, with regard to police and military personnel, ILO Convention 154 leaves it to the discretion of the national law-maker to determine the extent to which the guarantees provided for in the Convention apply. Indeed, according to Articles 1 (2) and (3) of Convention 154, the extent to which the guarantees provided for in this Convention apply to the armed forces and the police may be determined by national laws or regulations or national practice. As regards the public service, special modalities of application of this Convention may be fixed by national laws or regulations or national practice.

The paper will include a comparative analysis of the application of these provisions in 12 Member States of the European Union. Finally, we will try to draw up a relevant table as to how each national legislator understood to regulate this sensitive subject.

Keywords: *labour law, collective bargaining, comparative law, International Labour Organisation, military, police, public sector*

DOI: 10.24818/EBLJ/2023/2/1.01

1. Introduction

The right to collective bargaining is regulated differently depending on the legal system. A common basis does exist, however: this is the International Labour Organisation Convention no. 154 (1981), ratified by 50 states, including most of the member states of the European Union. This convention defines collective bargaining as extending to all negotiations which take place between an employer, a group of employers, or one or more employers' organisations, on the one hand, and one or more workers' organisations, on the other, for:

¹ This topic was presented at The International Conference “Perspectives of Business Law”, 12th edition, 18 November 2022, Bucharest (<http://europeanbusinesslaw.rsbl.ro/>), organised by the Faculty of Law, Bucharest University of Economic Studies and The Romanian Society of Business Law.

- (a) determining working conditions and terms of employment; and/or
- (b) regulating relations between employers and workers; and/or
- (c) regulating relations between employers or their organisations and a workers' organisation or workers' organisations.

However, with regard to police and military personnel, ILO Convention 154 leaves it to the discretion of the national legislature to determine the extent to which the guarantees provided for in the Convention apply. Indeed, according to Article 1 (2) and (3) of Convention 154, the extent to which the guarantees provided for in this Convention apply to the armed forces and the police may be determined by national laws or regulations or national practice. As regards the public service, special modalities of application of this Convention may be fixed by national laws or regulations or national practice. In the following, we will carry out a comparative analysis of the application of these provisions (which leaves a wide discretion to the national legislator) in Austria, Belgium, Denmark, Finland, France, Germany, Hungary, Italy, Netherlands, Poland, Romania, and Slovakia. Finally, we will try to draw up a relevant table as to how each national legislator understood to regulate this sensitive subject.

With regard to the application of Convention No. 154 to the armed forces and the police, the possibility of their exclusion from the scope of the Convention is to be inferred from:

- (i) Article 1(2) of the Convention, which provides that “the extent to which the guarantees provided for in this Convention apply to the armed forces and the police may be determined by national laws or regulations or national practice”;
- (ii) the preparatory work prior to the adoption of the Convention, during which the possibility of excluding these categories of workers, in part or in whole, from the scope of the Convention was specifically emphasised; and
- (iii) the interpretation which has always been given to Article 5(1) of Convention No. 98, which was drafted in similar terms to Article 1(2) of Convention No. 154, which allows States that have ratified the Convention to exclude the armed forces and the police from its scope.²

We note, as a preliminary point:

- Legislation in all of the following countries permitted police to unionise and bargain collectively: Austria, Belgium, Denmark, Finland, France, Germany, Netherlands, Romania, Slovakia;
- The right to organise and bargain collectively in the case of the army forces is much more restricted than in the case of police officers;
- Many states, even if they recognise the right to collective bargaining, specifically regulate the outcome of such negotiations, subject it to approvals, or expressly

² International Labour Conference, 102nd Session (2013), General Survey concerning labour relations and collective bargaining in the public service, p. 83

prohibit the right to strike in the case of law enforcement personnel. In some countries there are restrictions or exclusions for armed forces, police, fire brigades, or prison officers.

Restrictions on trade union rights in the case of the army forces are wider than in the case of the police. However, the case law of the European Committee of Social Rights (EUROMIL v Ireland 112/2014; CGIL v Italy 140/2016) acknowledged that prohibiting the military from organising and bargaining collectively is in violation of Article 6§4 of the European Social Charter. So, this is likely to change. As for the right to strike in the case of military personnel, of the states examined, it is recognised only in Austria.

Member States include different categories of workers in the category of public workers. We may distinguish:

- career civil servants;
- employees of local or central authorities (sometimes with separate status);
- public sector contract staff (employees under contract);
- employees of public companies, in which the state is the main shareholder;
- public and private sector workers providing public services.

The legal regulations on collective bargaining sometimes differ depending on the category of staff considered.

The right of association is universally permitted to both career civil servants and contractual employees, without distinction from private sector employees. However, when it comes to the right to collective bargaining in the case of career civil servants, some countries introduce restrictions.

2. Austria

Both military personnel and policemen have the right to organise. An example of an active trade union is the Federal Army Union.

Almost all public employees, not only career civil servants, are excluded from the right to conclude collective agreements; their terms and conditions of employment are unilaterally determined by the responsible authorities, although informal negotiations take place.

The right to strike has a very uncertain status for all public employees in Austria, where experts disagree whether and under which circumstances they can take industrial action. On the other hand, there is no formal basis for peace obligations, since no formal bargaining takes place in the public sector. Duties and remuneration are largely determined by legislation. For employees in the Länder, municipality groupings, and municipalities, the provisions of the laws of the respective Länder apply.³

³ Lorenzo Bordogna, Eurofound, Industrial relations in the public sector (2008), Industrial relations in the public sector | Eurofound (europa.eu).

As a result, most public sector workers are still covered by statute rather than collective agreements, but there are annual negotiations on pay that are implemented by statute⁴.

3. Belgium

Law enforcement personnel have the right to organise. Example of active trade unions are ACMP-CGPM (military union) or National Union of Belgian Police. Police representatives can negotiate according to the Ministerial Circular of 17 March 2014.⁵ Moreover, Police forces have had the right to strike since 1999, but they have to abide by strict rules. According to Article 9 of the Ministerial Circular GPI 80/2014, the right to strike by police is subject to the prior announcement of the strike by an approved union organisation and prior discussion of this notice in the negotiating committee for police services.⁶

Competent authorities cannot, without prior negotiation with the representative trade unions, draw up preliminary drafts of laws and draft implementing decrees which regulate the recruitment, rights and obligations of military members and their promotion and relations with trade unions. There is, however, an explicit prohibition on strikes in case of army forces.

Collective bargaining in the public sector is allowed. In Belgium, collective bargaining takes place prior to the adoption of laws or administrative regulations covered by collective agreements.⁷

Although negotiations and consultations take place between government and trade unions over pay and other issues, the agreements (*protocols*) are not legally binding, and the government can act unilaterally. Although not legally binding like private sector collective agreements, protocols have a moral and political force.⁸

The pay system in the federal public sector contains an automatic wage indexation, which weakens the parts of agreements relating to pay.

In Belgium, strikes by civil servants were traditionally considered an act of subversion, but since the adoption of the European Social Charter the right to strike of civil servants is implicitly recognised. In some cases, the private sector law on the

⁴ EPSU, *Collective bargaining developments in the public services* (2021), <https://www.epsu.org/article/collective-bargaining-developments-public-services>

⁵ ILO's Legal Database on Industrial Relations (IRLex)

⁶ *Idem*

⁷ International Labour Conference, 102nd Session (2013), General Survey concerning labour relations and collective bargaining in the public service, p. 90

⁸ See Collectively agreed wages in Belgium: indicators and trends; by Sem Vanderkerckhove and Guy van Gyes, HIVA-KU Leuven, 2012 https://hiva.kuleuven.be/resources/docs/vorming/20121129_CAWIEpaper_Belgium.pdf

provision of minimal services in the case of industrial action is extended to civil servants.⁹

4. Denmark

The armed forces and the police are covered by the same rules concerning freedom of association and the right to collective bargaining¹⁰. There is, however, no right to strike.

Civil servants' working conditions and wages are subject to negotiations between the employers and trade unions, although the basic conditions and pension schemes are regulated by statutes.¹¹ Pay in the central government sector is regulated only by collective bargaining.

Statutory civil servants and contractual staff have two separate collective agreements:

- There is a main central agreement for statutory civil servants, concluded between the State Employer's Authority (*Personalestyrelsen*) – a separately managed agency within the Ministry of Finance – and the Danish Central Federation of State Employee Organisations (*Centralorganisationernes Fællesudvalg, CFU*), representing five central organisations;
- There is also a main central agreement for contractual staff, between the Minister of Finance and the unions representing public contractual staff.

Contractual employees can strike for contract renewal, but are subject to peace obligation clauses during the period of validity of collective agreements. On the other hand, civil servants do not have the right to strike.¹²

5. Finland

All police administration employees work in public-service employment relationships. There are no employees in a contractual employment relationship in the police. The police administration has separate agreements, employer decisions, and application instructions.¹³

Salaries, working hours, and other terms of the employment relationship are set out in collective agreement documents.

⁹ Lorenzo Bordogna, Eurofound, *Industrial relations in the public sector* (2008) Industrial relations in the public sector | Eurofound (europa.eu)

¹⁰ International Labour Office, *Collective bargaining in the public service in the European Union* (2015), p. 2, https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_dialogue/---sector/documents/publication/wcms_429795.pdf

¹¹ Lorenzo Bordogna, op. cit.

¹² Idem.

¹³ Collective agreements of police administration, <https://poliisi.fi/en/collective-agreements-of-police-administration>.

In Finland, The Collective Agreement for State Civil Servants and Employees Under Contract is applied to state employees.¹⁴ There is only one 'combined' collective agreement at central level for both career civil servants and employees under contract, signed by the State Employer's Office (*Valtion työmarkkinailaitos, VTML*), a unit within the Ministry of Finance, and the three national employee organisations for central government. The central-level agreement may be supplemented by agency-specific (local) agreements for both civil servants and employees under contract, managed by agencies and the unions at agency level, approved by the Ministry of Finance.¹⁵ Basically, no one is excluded from the right to collective bargaining.

6. France

Police officers have trade unions, for example *Alliance Police Nationale*. However, the military cannot organise in unions. While members of the National Police force have the right to form and join a trade union, members of the Gendarmerie (the military police) do not. Art. 4121-4 of the Defence Code provides that the existence of professional military groups of a union nature, as well as the joining to these groups by military personnel in active service, is incompatible with the rules of military discipline.¹⁶ This Article also provides that the right of strike cannot be exercised by military forces.¹⁷ However, the European Court of Human Rights ruled in 2014 that the blanket ban on trade unions in the French army violates article 11 of the European Convention on Human Rights that protects the right to freedom of assembly and association, including the right to form trade unions.¹⁸

For now, in France, police, military, prison workers, and magistrates are not allowed to strike.

The Labour Code separates career civil servants from public employees under contract:

- Public and civil servants not employed in terms of private law fall outside the scope of the Title relating to collective bargaining;¹⁹
- Provisions concerning collective bargaining included in the Labour Code shall apply to public industrial and commercial establishments and to public

¹⁴ *Idem*.

¹⁵ Lorenzo Bordogna, *Eurofound*, Industrial relations in the public sector (2008), Industrial relations in the public sector | Eurofound (europa.eu)

¹⁶ Art. L411-4 of Code on Homeland Security states: "National Police personnel in active service do not have the right to strike."

¹⁷ ILO's Legal Database on Industrial Relations (IRLex)

¹⁸ See *ADEFDROMIL v. France* (Requête no. 32191/09) and *Matelly v. France* (Requête no 10609/10), 2 Oct. 2014

¹⁹ ILO's Legal Database on Industrial Relations (IRLex)

administrative institutions when they employ staff under the conditions of private law.²⁰

Trade unions in the public sector are recognised as capable (*ont la qualité*) of conducting preliminary negotiations with the government at the national level over pay increases, but these negotiations are not compulsory (they can be held or not). If these negotiations do take place, they may lead to an agreement, but not necessarily. Ultimately, the government may use this (possible) agreement when determining wage increases, but is also free to disregard it. Despite this weakness of the legal basis of collective bargaining, important negotiations have taken place over the last years.²¹

7. Germany

Police officers can organise in unions and bargain collectively. An example of such an organisation is the German Police Union (*Gewerkschaft der Polizei*). Police unions serve an important role in negotiating fair wages and benefits for their members²².

The military associations are recognised by the ministry of defence for negotiating purposes and have very high rates of participation by eligible members of the armed forces²³.

There are two categories of public service workers: civil servants (*Beamte*) and public employees (*Beschäftigte des öffentlichen Dienstes*).

Career public servants (*Beamte*) enjoy a special status. According to constitutional law, career public servants are individuals who are appointed by the state (the Federal Government or the authorities of the individual Länder), a municipality or other legal persons under public law, by being given a letter of appointment containing the words "appointed to the career public service relationship". They have the benefit of a special, state-administered duty of care on the part of their public sector employer, in respect of whom they, in turn, are subject to a special duty of loyalty. Appointment to the career public service relationship is permissible only in

²⁰ "Les dispositions du présent livre sont applicables aux employeurs de droit privé ainsi qu'à leurs salariés. Elles sont également applicables :

1° Aux établissements publics à caractère industriel et commercial ;

2° Aux établissements publics à caractère administratif lorsqu'ils emploient du personnel dans les conditions du droit privé"

²¹ Lorenzo Bordogna, *Eurofound*, Industrial relations in the public sector (2008), Industrial relations in the public sector | Eurofound (europa.eu)

²² Stephen Rushin, *Reforming Police Union Contracts and Law Enforcement Officer Bills of Rights*, (2020), <https://theappeal.org/the-lab/report/reforming-police-union-contracts-and-law-enforcement-officer-bills-of-rights/>

²³ Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe, *Handbook on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms of Armed Forces Personnel*, https://www.europarl.europa.eu/meetdocs/2009_2014/documents/sede/dv/sede291111odihrrhandbook_/sede291111odihrrhandbook_en.pdf

order to take on sovereign functions of public administration or functions which, for reasons of national security or particular importance for public life, cannot be entrusted exclusively to individuals who are employed in an employment relationship under private law. Career public servants, which amount to more than 40% of total central government employees,²⁴ are allowed to form and to join trade unions and interest organisations,²⁵ but are excluded from collective bargaining and have no right to strike. In June 2018, the German Constitutional Court ruling confirmed that civil servants do not have the right to strike. The judgment was based on the argument that civil servants have a special relationship of trust with the state.²⁶

8. Hungary

Both military personnel and policemen have the right to organise. But law enforcement personnel can neither bargain collectively nor conclude collective agreements.²⁷ Indeed, Act XLII of 2015 on the Service Status of Professional Members of Law Enforcement Agencies, which regulates the labour relations of police forces, does not provide any possibility for collective bargaining or the conclusion of collective agreements²⁸.

Regarding public workers:

- On the one hand, in Hungary, the strict letter of the law rules out collective bargaining in the public administration, although there are several consultations between government and the unions, at central (including on pay increases) and local levels, which can lead to agreements.²⁹ Indeed, civil servants, government officials (i.e. working in ministries, central and territorial administration, mayor's offices, etc.) are not allowed to bargain collectively and conclude collective agreements.
- On the other hand, public employees under contract (i.e. teachers, librarians, public health staff, etc.) can bargain collectively and conclude collective agreements. However, the room for collective bargaining is narrower than in the private sector, as the collective agreement can derogate from the provisions of the law only when authorised by such legislation.

²⁴ Lorenzo Bordogna, *op. cit.*

²⁵ Keller, B. (2020) Employment relations without collective bargaining and strikes: the unusual case of civil servants in Germany, "Industrial Relations Journal", 51, 110– 133, <https://doi.org/10.1111/irj.12284>.

²⁶ Heiner Dribbusch, Eurofound, *Industrial relations in the public sector – Germany*, <https://www.eurofound.europa.eu/publications/report/2008/industrial-relations-in-the-public-sector-germany>.

²⁷ ILO, CEE Labour Legislation database

²⁸ ILO's Legal Database on Industrial Relations (IRLex)

²⁹ Lorenzo Bordogna, Eurofound, *Industrial relations in the public sector (2008)*, Industrial relations in the public sector | Eurofound (europa.eu)

In state/municipal-owned companies (covered by the Labour Code), collective agreements must not deviate from basic mandatory statutory rules³⁰.

In public administration authorities the right to strike may be exercised according to the special regulations fixed in the agreement between the Government and the trade unions concerned. However, professional staff members of the National Tax and Customs Authority (*Nemzeti Adóés Vámhivatal*) may not exercise the right to strike.³¹ Also, the judiciary is not allowed to strike.³²

In conclusion, in the Hungarian public sector, genuine bipartite collective bargaining rights are limited to public service employees, typically education, health and social care and cultural facilities' staff, while the law prohibits bargaining for public servants and military, law enforcement, and fighter personnel.³³

9. Italy

Police and armed forces may have their own, separate trade unions or professional associations, or, for the armed forces, some specific forms of representations.

Policemen can only be affiliated to police trade unions created only by workers employed in Police.

Art. 1475 Legislative Decree No.66/2010 provides that "(1). The establishment of associations or clubs between military is subject to the prior consent of the Minister of Defence. (2) The military cannot constitute professional associations, trade unions, or join other unions. (3) The military cannot join associations considered secret in accordance with law and incompatible with the obligations arising from oath. (4). The military cannot exercise the right to strike".³⁴

Therefore, in Italy, the armed forces and police are formally excluded from collective bargaining. However, these employees have forms of negotiations to determine at least part of their terms and conditions of employment, although using separate procedures from those of other central government and public sector employees.³⁵ The agreements must be transposed into a decree of the President of the Republic.³⁶ Despite Law No. 121/1981 foresees that Police enjoys a different regime of "freedom of association", policeman have anyway the right to collective bargaining.

All 'contractualised' public employees are currently divided in 12 sub-sectors of very different size, each corresponding to a bargaining unit, and three of which

³⁰ ILO, CEE Labour Legislation database

³¹ *Idem*

³² *Idem*

³³ Szilvia Borbély and László Neumann, Neglected by the state: the Hungarian experience of collective bargaining, in "Collective bargaining in Europe", (eds.: Torsten Müller, Kurt Vandaele, Jeremy Waddington), vol II, ETUI, p. 305

³⁴ ILO's Legal Database on Industrial Relations (IRLex)

³⁵ *Idem*

³⁶ Lorenzo Bordogna, *op. cit.*

belong to central government (ministries, tax agencies, the Prime Minister's Office). In each sub-sector, two levels of negotiations occur: one at central, national level; and one at a decentralised level (for instance, there is one national-level collective agreement for all the ministries, and several decentralised agreements – one for each ministry, and sometimes also for local-level administrative units). Wage increases are set at the central level every two years, linked to the planned rates of inflation fixed in the national budget law (the planned rate of inflation is an economic policy target, different from expected inflation), and partly in decentralised collective agreements.

Prefects are excluded entirely from collective bargaining.³⁷

10. The Netherlands

Both military personnel and policemen have the right to organise³⁸. For instance, one of the trade unions is The *Dutch Police Union (Nederlandse Politiebond)*. Negotiation takes place with representatives of the central government.³⁹

Normally, military servants in active service have no right to strike. Where military personnel have the right to organise and bargain collectively, collective action other than strike action may be permissible, provided that it does not undermine the effectiveness of the armed forces.⁴⁰

Civil servants have the right to collective bargaining, but this does not lead, from a legal perspective, to real collective agreements, since the law on collective agreements does not apply to the government sector. However, the employer – the Minister of Internal Affairs – cannot unilaterally change the terms of employment of civil servants, but has to reach an agreement with a majority of the four trade unions in the Sectoral Consultation Committee for Government Employees (*Sectorcommissie Overleg Rijkspersoneel, SOR*).⁴¹

Dutch law does not impose a direct prohibition, but follows a casuistic approach regarding public servants' right to strike.⁴²

11. Poland

Only certain categories of police officers can form trade unions. Officers of the Internal Security Agency and the Intelligence Agency, the Central Anti-Corruption

³⁷ *Idem*.

³⁸ EPSU, ETUI, *The right to strike in the public sector – Netherlands* (2018) <https://www.epsu.org/sites/default/files/article/files/Netherlands%20%20Right%20to%20strike%20in%20public%20sector.pdf>

³⁹ https://www.mites.gob.es/ficheros/ministerio/sec_trabajo/ccncc/B_Actuaciones/Estudios/CollectiveBargainingInEurope.pdf, p. 148

⁴⁰ EPSU, ETUI, *The right to strike in the public sector – Netherlands* (2018), *op. cit.*

⁴¹ Lorenzo Bordogna, *op. cit.*

⁴² EPSU, ETUI, *The right to strike in the public sector – Netherlands* (2018), *op. cit.*

Bureau, and the State Security Service are not allowed to associate in trade unions. Professional soldiers are not allowed to form and join trade unions.

Police and security officers and defence forces are excluded from collective labour agreements⁴³.

In Poland, civil servants are allowed to join a union, but not to assume any function. Collective bargaining is restricted or excluded for civil servants, but it is also very limited or totally absent for central government contractual employees because of the great weakness or absence of trade unions in the sector.⁴⁴ According to Polish legislation, collective agreements cannot be concluded for civil service employees, employees of State offices employed on the basis of nomination or appointment, local government authorities employed on the basis of election, nomination or appointment (marshal's offices, district offices, local authority offices, unions of local government offices, offices of administrative units of local government), as well as judges and prosecutors.⁴⁵

There are specific regulations for the public sector prohibiting the right to strike for those employed in state authorities, government and self-government administration, courts and public prosecutors' offices. This includes even manual and auxiliary workers who do not exercise authority in the name of the state⁴⁶.

12. Romania

Police officers can organise in unions and have the right to collective bargaining, but the active military cannot. However, there are trade union associations of the reserve military, such as the Reserve Military Union (*Sindicatul Cadrelor Militare in Rezervă*).

According to Law no. 62/2011, the following categories of personnel cannot strike: prosecutors, judges, military personnel, staff with special status in the Ministry of National Defense, Ministry of Interior, Ministry of Justice, institutions of control supervision, including the National Administration of Prisons, the Intelligence Service, the Foreign Intelligence Service, the Special Telecommunications Service, the personnel employed by foreign armed forces stationed in Romania.

Therefore, the active military and the police cannot go on strike.

All public servants, public servants with special status, high-level public servants responsible for public decision making, and public administrators, with the exception of military officers engaged in the defence system, the maintenance of public order, and national security, enjoy the right to collective bargaining.

⁴³ ILO, CEE Labour Legislation database

⁴⁴ Lorenzo Bordogna, *op. cit.*

⁴⁵ ILO, CEE Labour Legislation database

⁴⁶ EPSU, *The right to strike in the public sector in Europe* (2019), <https://www.epsu.org/article/right-strike-public-sector-europe>

Therefore, both civil servants and public employees under contract have the right to collective bargaining⁴⁷. The difference lies in the outcome: in the case of employees a collective labour contract (*contract colectiv de muncă*) can be concluded, while in the case of civil servants a collective agreement (*acord colectiv*) can be concluded. The two legal acts are governed by separate laws, but have a similar content.

Civil servants and public employees under contract can go on strike.

13. Slovakia

Soldiers in active services are not allowed to form and join trade unions. Trade unions rights of members of the National Security Corps and the Penitentiary Forces are regulated by special legislation.

Strikes by judges, prosecutors, members of the armed forces and armed corps, members and employees of fire brigades and rescue corps and employees in air traffic control are unlawful.

Strikes by civil servants are prohibited if their participation in the strike endangers the life or health of the population.⁴⁸ Basically, workers in whole sectors of the civil service, public utilities, “crucial enterprises”, and essential services are excluded from the right to strike⁴⁹.

14. Conclusions

Collective bargaining is not regulated at the European level; the national legislator decides, in each member state, how it intends to regulate collective bargaining in these sectors. According to the European legislation, the personnel who work in these sectors have the quality of “worker”, and the legal relationships under which they work are employment relationships. However, given the special situation in which these workers find themselves, national regulations show significant differences from one state to another.

In summary, the collective bargaining in the case of the police, the army, and civil servants in the 12 states analysed is carried out according to the table below. The table is a simplification; there are many nuances in each legal system, which I have presented, in part, above.

⁴⁷ See also, *Dimitriu, R.*, Particularități ale dialogului social în cadrul autorităților și instituțiilor publice, [Specificities of the social dialogue within public authorities and institutions], 2010, *Revista Transilvană de Științe Administrative*, nr. 3(27), pp. 41-60.

⁴⁸ ILO, CEE Labour Legislation database

⁴⁹ EPSU, *The right to strike in the public sector in Europe* (2019), <https://www.epsu.org/article/right-strike-public-sector-europe>

	Austria	Belgium	Denmark	Finland	France	Germany	Hungary	Italy	The Netherlands	Poland	Romania	Slovakia
Right to collective bargain – police	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
Right to collective bargain – army forces	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	No	No
Right to collective bargain - career civil servants	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
Right to strike – police	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	Yes
Right to strike - army forces	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No
Right to strike - career civil servants	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No

References

- Borbély, Szilvia and Neumann, László*, Neglected by the state: the Hungarian experience of collective bargaining, in “Collective bargaining in Europe”, (eds.: Torsten Müller, Kurt Vandaele, Jeremy Waddington), vol II, ETUI
- Bordogna, Lorenzo, Eurofound, *Industrial relations in the public sector* (2008), Industrial relations in the public sector | Eurofound (europa.eu)
- Dimitriu, R.*, Particularități ale dialogului social în cadrul autorităților și instituțiilor publice, [Specificities of the social dialogue within public authorities and institutions], 2010, Revista Transilvană de Științe Administrative, nr. 3(27), pp. 41-60.
- Dribbusch, Heiner, Eurofound, *Industrial relations in the public sector – Germany*, <https://www.eurofound.europa.eu/publications/report/2008/industrial-relations-in-the-public-sector-germany>.

- EPSU, *Collective bargaining developments in the public services* (2021), <https://www.epsu.org/article/collective-bargaining-developments-public-services>
- EPSU, ETUI, *The right to strike in the public sector – Netherlands* (2018) <https://www.epsu.org/sites/default/files/article/files/Netherlands%20-%20Right%20to%20strike%20in%20public%20sector.pdf>
- EPSU, *The right to strike in the public sector in Europe* (2019), <https://www.epsu.org/article/right-strike-public-sector-europe>
- <https://www.eurofound.europa.eu/publications/report/2008/industrial-relations-in-the-public-sector-germany>.
- International Labour Conference, 102nd Session (2013), General Survey concerning labour relations and collective bargaining in the public service
- International Labour Office, *Collective bargaining in the public service in the European Union* (2015), https://www.ilo.org/wcmsp5/groups/public/---ed_dialogue/---sector/documents/publication/wcms_429795.pdf
- Keller, B. (2020) *Employment relations without collective bargaining and strikes: the unusual case of civil servants in Germany*, "Industrial Relations Journal", 51, 110-133, <https://doi.org/10.1111/irj.12284>.
- Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe, *Handbook on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms of Armed Forces Personnel*, https://www.europarl.europa.eu/meetdocs/2009_2014/documents/sede/dv/sede291111odihrhandbook_/sede291111odihrhandbook_en.pdf
- Rushin, Stephen, *Reforming Police Union Contracts and Law Enforcement Officer Bills of Rights*, (2020), <https://theappeal.org/the-lab/report/reforming-police-union-contracts-and-law-enforcement-officer-bills-of-rights/>
- Vanderkerckhove, Sem and van Gyes, Guy, *Collectively agreed wages in Belgium: indicators and trends*; HIVA-KU Leuven, 2012, https://hiva.kuleuven.be/resources/docs/vorming/20121129_CAWIEpaper_Belgium.pdf